

#### РЕПУБЛИКА МАКЕДОНИЈА Универзитет "Св. Кирил и Методиј" – Скопје Факултет за информатички науки и компјутерско инженерство



# Report on external evaluation of the NatRisk project "Development of master curricula for natural disasters risk management in the Western Balkan countries"

#### ERASMUS 573806-EPP-1-2016-1-RS-EPPKA2-CBHE-JP

Prevention and management of natural disaster risk management (NDRM) in the region of Western Balkan (WB) through the development and implementation of new master curricula and educational training sessions for the public sector and citizens are the main goals of the NatRisk project as specified by activities defined in 8 workpackages. Originally, the project was scheduled to run as of 15-10.2016 and end by 14-10-2019. The initiation of the newly developed master curricula was among the main deliverables and desired outcomes was. However, the accreditation process of the new master curricula was prolonged due to complex administrative procedures, and an extension is approved until 14-04-2020, with the expectation that all deliverables will be realized and completed.

This report contains two parts: 1) an overview of the achievement of activities realized from the previous report, delivered on 31.08.2018, covering the last 12 months; and 2) an evaluation of overall project relevance, efficiency and effectivity, overall impact and project sustainability.

## Report on achievement of project activities and outcomes

The following table gives an overview of realized activities. Grey background is presented for those that are still in progress. The yellow background addresses activities that were scheduled to be realized in this period, and for which there is no evidence of successful finalization. Some of the activities are ongoing, such as the final Steering meeting, or other management activities, which are normal, since they will be realized in the forthcoming period. A set of activities, including accreditation and implementation of master curricula with an enrolment of students are scheduled for the prolongation period and are expected to be realized soon. Some EU partners are not engaged in these implementation activities, and for them, the corresponding fields are left empty.

Progress of realised tasks X – completed task % – in progress N/A – document not available	UNI	BOKU Vienna	MUHEC	UNIME	OE Obuda	TUC Crete Chania	UNID Belgrade	KPA	UPKM Pristina-KM	UNSA Sarajevo	UBL Banja Luka	TCASU Liposavac
1.1 Identification of natural disasters to be managed in WB	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	х	X	Х	Х
1.2 Introduction with established practices in EU countries for NDRM	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	х	X	Х	Х
1.3 Workshop on master curricula best practices in EU countries	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	х	X	Х	Х
2.1 Development of aims, specific competencies and learning outcomes of master curricula in WB HEIs	х	X	X	X	x	х	x	X	x	x	x	Х
2.2 Development of courses content and syllabi	Х	X	X	X	Х	Х	Х	X	X	X	Х	Х
2.3 Training of teaching staff for innovative	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	X	X	Х	X	X	Х

Progress of realised tasks X – completed task % – in progress N/A – document not available	IN SiN	BOKU Vienna	MUHEC	UNIME Messina	OE Obuda	TUC Crete Chania	UNID	KPA	UPKM Pristina-KM	UNSA Sarajevo	UBL Banja Luka	TCASU Liposavac
teaching methods												
2.4 Providing of students' internships	х	х	Х	Х	х	х	Х	Х	х	Х	Х	Х
positions 2.5 Harmonization of teaching environment												
with EU best practices and purchasing of laboratory equipment and literature	х						X	X	x	X	X	X
3.1 Surveillance of citizens' and public sector awareness regarding natural disasters	х	X	X	х	x	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
3.2 Study visits and analysis of courses best practices in EU countries	х	х	Х	Х	х	Х	Х	Х	х	Х	Х	Х
3.3 Development of trainings' content corresponding educational materials and selection of teaching staff	х	х	х	х	х	х	х	X	х	х	х	х
4.1 Defining of admission requirements and enrolment of students	Х						N/A	N/A	N/A	X	X	X
4.2 Implementation of master curricula	Х						N/A	N/A	N/A	Х	X	Х
4.3 Implementation of students' internships	Х						Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х
4.4 Implementation of trainings for citizens and public sector	х						х	Х	х	х	Х	х
4.5 Self-evaluation of master curricula	X						N/A	N/A	N/A	X	X	X
4.6 Self-evaluation of trainings for citizens and public sector	х						X	Х	х	х	х	х
5.1 Regular Quality Assurance Committee meetings	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %
5.2 Development of the quality control plan	Х	X	X	X	X	X	X	Х	Х	X	X	X
5.3 External evaluation of the project	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	X	Х
5.4 External financial control	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %
5.5 Inter-project coaching	X	Х	X	Х	Х	X	X	X	Х	Х	X	Х
6.1 Creation of the dissemination plan for the project	Х	х	Х	х	х	х	Х	Х	х	х	Х	х
6.2 Development and maintenance of project website and creation of promotional materials and campaigns	70 %	70 %	70 %	70 %	70 %	70 %	70 %	70 %	70 %	70 %	70 %	70 %
6.3 Promotional activity for student enrolment	х						N/A	N/A	N/A	х	Х	х
6.4 Promotional activity for trainings	Х	X	X	Х	Х	X	X	X	Х	X	X	X
7.1 Creation of sustainability plan	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	X	X	X	Х	Х	X	X
7.2 Accreditation of master curricula	Х						Х	N/A	N/A	Х	X	Х
7.3 Realization of student and staff mobilities between WB and EU partners	х	х	х	х	х	х	х	Х	х	х	х	х
8.1 Kick-off meeting	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Χ	Х
8.2 Regular Steering Committee and	90	90	90	90	90	90	90	90	90	90	90	90
Project Management meetings 8.3 Development of guidelines on the project management and reporting	% X	% X	% X	% X	% X	% X	% X	% X	% X	% X	% X	% X
8.4 Preventive Field Visits	90	90	90	90	90	90	90	90	90	90	90	90
U.T. I TOVETILIVE I TOTAL VISILS	% 90	% 90	% 90	% 90	% 90	% 90	% 90	% 90	% 90	% 90	% 90	% 90
8.5 Submission of interim and final reports	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %	90 %

#### Overall achievement of activities

WP1 "Analysis of natural disasters to be managed in WB region" is completely realized. All activities are well planned and realized, and the outcomes are reported by an excellent report and brochure about identified natural disaster analysis in WB countries and EU practices for risk management strategies how to deal in these situations. Also, a comprehensive report was created with the identification of key elements of curricula design at partner WB countries.

Development of master curricula, as a goal of WP2, was realized successfully and all relevant curricula and relevant content was developed.

Only documents about tender call are present on the web site without a report if the equipment purchased and installed. A comprehensive report is available on demand, including all financial and implementation details. I recommend the consortium partners to provide a self-evaluation report and survey about user satisfaction of purchased equipment and literature.

WP3 "Development of training sessions for citizens and public sector" was successfully completed, all campaigns about raising awareness, study visits and training content development were documented and reported correspondingly.

Implementation of developed master curricula and training sessions was addressed in WP4. Unfortunately, only the trainings were successfully realized and correspondingly self-evaluated, but the master curricula *are still not accredited and fully implemented by all partners*. Since this is a serious obstacle for successful project realization, a project prolongation is asked until the administrative procedures are completed and master study implemented, and admission requirements and student enrolment realized. The prolongation is obtained for a six-month period. UNI, UNISA, UBL, and TCASU have developed admission requirements and successfully realized enrolment of students (activity 4.1, 4.2 and 4.5), while the other WB partners have not finalized these activities completely or there is no available documentation. The other three activities within this workpackage, including 4.3, 4.4 and 4.6 were completed and reported successfully.

Quality assurance and monitoring were addressed in WP5. All relevant activities were successfully realized and well documented. Some of the activities are still to be realized, including the sixth QA steering committee meeting. I recommend that another committee meeting (seventh) to be held by the new end of the project obtained by project prolongation to confirm the quality of the final deliverables, project activities and results. Analyzing the activity 5.4 addressing the external financial control, a company was selected and they are scheduled to deliver report at later stage.

WP 6 "Dissemination" has been realized successfully with a major remark that the web site is not updated with all dissemination activities, events and promotional material in the last year. Since the master curricula are not fully implemented by UNID, KPU, and UPKM, there are no corresponding promotional activities organized for student enrollment. UNIPD has accredited the program and student enrollment is expected at later stage.

Exploitation workpackage WP7 delivered a good sustainability plan with financial and administrative aspects (activity 7.1) and realized successfully student and staff mobility (activity 7.3). The activity 7.2 was not realized completely by UNID, KPU and UPKM consortium members since they have not accredited the master curricula and enrolled students. These are expected to be finalized by the end of the six-month prolongation period. Project management specified WP8 was organized successfully, with a remark that not all obstacles were analyzed for administrative procedures, so the accreditation and student enrolment of the new master curricula was not implemented fully by UNID, KPU and UPKM. All other management activities, including internal reviews, self-evaluation, daily communication, etc. were performed on a highly professional level and relevant measures were taken to ensure that the project objectives are delivered effectively and within specified

deadline. Due to project prolongation, there is a sneed for organizing more management and quality control activities, including internal review of those deliverables that were not completed on time.

## Overall project relevance

All realized activities within this project are relevant to the main goal to educate experts for prevention and management of natural disaster risk management (NDRM) in the region of Western Balkan (WB) through the development and implementation of the new master curricula and educational training sessions for the public sector and citizens. The real problems and needs were addressed by project objectives and delivered project results target all foreseen beneficiaries.

A raising awareness event for a wider community including the Western Balkan region and those that were not included in the project, as a highly appreciated add-on to this project is planned for 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> September 2019.

The realized project objectives are a really good basis to initiate an update and development of the risk management initiatives within governments both on national and local levels. This will ensure that those educated by the corresponding master degree will be employed to deal with management of natural disasters and use the gained knowledge in their future professional development, and participate in building a national or regional strategy and action plans.

The relevance of dissemination actions is well confirmed by reports on all organized events and delivered promotional material, reaching targeted audience, both with the quantity of the organized dissemination activities and quality of the user satisfaction of dissemination surveys.

Planned and organized sustainability measures are also relevant to the project goal, although some of the consortium members were delayed to implement corresponding deliverables.

# Overall project efficiency

The first part of the project was really efficient, all the activities and outcomes were delivered on time and the project was coordinated and managed in a professional manner. However, due to lack of foreseeing the administrative and external factors, the delivery of the most important deliverables was prolonged. This is common for the Western Balkan countries, where the other irrelevant factors influence the overall politics and normal execution of the projects, so the processes of development, accreditation, and implementation of master curricula, along with enrolment of students for the new program were delayed for some of the members of the project, and a 6-month prolongation was more than necessary.

So although, all participants were properly communicated with sophisticated management platform and ICT tools, the project was coordinated and the execution of activities monitored, still some consortium partners haven't completed the expected results within the planned deadline.

Reporting was realized on a high level, until the end of 2018, and all activities, organized events, training sessions and seminars were well documented and relevant docs are shared on the project web site. However, this has not been realized for the first half of 2019, and not all docs are available on the project web site, so there is a gap in updating the project results and making them visible for a wider community.

Besides the justified prolongation, I have noticed that no severe deviations have been noticed in project executions. Overall, all the project inputs and activities were successfully transformed into outputs with justified prolongation of the deliverables for some of the consortium members, where the scheduled tasks are not finalized within the planned deadline.

# **Overall project effectivity**

This project confirms that the right things have been performed and the main outcomes reached. Although, some consortium partners haven't finalized the processes of developing, accrediting, implementing and enrolling students for new master curricula, the majority of the partners have been following the project plan and delivered the project outcomes with high effectiveness.

Analyzing the project proposal, all defined wider and specific objectives are fulfilled and main outputs delivered.

Reporting on the project web site needs to be updated and somehow reorganized to extract the overall achievements on the top of the corresponding page that describes each activity or task.

Dissemination activities were realized following the delivered dissemination strategy on a high level supporting raising awareness and training of relevant officers for risk management in case of disasters.

## Overall project impact

The overall project goals have been reached contributing to a high impact. The developed analysis and risk management procedures impact the relevant officers and the developed learning material and master curricula will produce quality staff that will help the national efforts in risk management of disasters.

A quantitative measure of the overall project impact is not possible due to a lack of information about the comparison of the risk management strategies and staff competent to manage the disaster consequences.

The project impact can be also presented by a summary of the main project results and deliverables:

#### Capacity building

- A total of 5 training sessions were organized by the EU project partners.
- 87 teaching staff has been trained for innovative methods in conduction of teaching and advancing the learning process.
- Three offices of international relations were established.
- A total of 7 labs were equipped with necessary equipment and literature.
- 6 master programs have been developed, along with one higher education degree,
- modernization of one master degree program.
- 14 training sessions were organized for more than 500 students and public officers out of 150 different institutions.
- A total of 115 mobility visits have been organized for 1200 days, along with 25 student mobility visits for more than 120 months.

#### Sustainability

- 5 master programs have been accredited and 4 have already enrolled 72 students for master degree in the 2018/2019 academic year.
- A survey was conducted with 3058 persons on disaster risk management and results published.
- Four manuals and brochures were delivered to civil sector professionals for natural disasters.
- 26 inter/institutional agreements signed between Western Balkan higher education institutions and EU partners.

#### Dissemination

• More than 80 events (conferences, seminars, workshops, info days), and also on radio and TV presentations.

- More than 10 brochures, info leaflets and web online editions.
- Web site promotion.
- TV and radio interviews, press releases.

## **Project sustainability**

Sustainability plan has been delivered on financial and academic level. Most of the consortium partners have implemented master curricula and enabled relevant sustainability measures for the realization of master curricula, conducting the education of relevant staff, organizing trainings for national institutions delegated to manage natural disasters, etc. Some of the consortium partners were delayed in delivering the outcomes until the new deadline planned for a six-month project prolongation.

The project has already initiated several add-on projects values, including strategy and documentation related to mobility, corresponding action plans, guidelines for students and staff exchange, internationalization strategy, forming International Relations Offices.

# Final remarks to be corrected in the project prolongation period

The following is a summary of the main findings that need to be improved in the forthcoming prolongation period:

- Some consortium partners haven't completed the expected results within the specified deadline, mainly due to administrative reasons.
- The web site needs to be updated with relevant documents, project events and outcomes making them visible for a wider community.
- Self-evaluation should be done on implementation, lab equipment and learning literature as well, with answers to the questions, such as are all planned items purchased; is purchased equipment located in the corresponding facilities and available to desired users; are the users satisfied with the equipment and literature; does the purchased equipment and literature fulfils their specification; does it fulfil their expectations.
- Risk management concerning human-related or technological-related disasters, including resilient computing and communication services protecting end-user applications in the case of disasters need to be covered in the update of the master curricula.

The following is a list of minor remarks to be corrected prior to project finalization:

- List of consortium members needs to be updated on the project web site. Now the consortium from WB countries are only presented with shortcuts (UNI, UNID, ...) without full details of the university, even the EU partners are not assigned with shortcuts.
- Some links on the web site need to be updated if they refer to non-existing sites (for example tender documentation).
- Some reports include the wordings "more than 90 institutions", or "more than 240 persons". The reports should be corrected using exact numbers.
- Only two student internships were reported on the project web site, and more were realized.
- Training sessions for citizens and public sector (4.4) and self-evaluation (4.6) were described well, while the implementation of master curricula (4.2) and corresponding self-evaluation (4.5) are not.
- The first external evaluation report is not published.
- There is no promotional material for student enrolment from UNI on the project web site.

- There is no information or report how much promotional material has been disseminated and what is the effect of it is not reported.
- A lot of events are described in the dissemination plan, but there are no reports about the fulfilment of the dissemination plan on the project web site. Only activities that have been conducted in 2016 and 2017 are enlisted, and no other, although planned.
- There is no sufficient information about press releases on the project web site.
- The organizer of the event should also report on the selection criteria for all participants on realized activities, in order to ensure that the main target audience is communicated.
- Regional cooperation needs to be improved by sending a summary of project achievements to other universities within the countries of the project consortium and wider to improve the regional cooperation as this is one of the project outcomes.

## Final remarks and impression

When I reviewed this project for the first time, after approximately half of the running period, I thought that everything works perfect, the activities are well planned, quality deliverables completed, all relevant documents promoted on the web site with high quality of the project management, everything runs smoothly. This project was my favorite and was delighted to show to others how quality management was on a high level. However, due to external administrative reasons the accreditation process was impossible for a period of 8 months, and therefore, the project was prolonged for 6 months. Also, the web site was not updated properly as in the beginning of the project realization. I believe that these two important issues (master curricula implementation and web site update) will be corrected and the project will deliver planned outcomes as it was originally planned with sufficient information publically available on the web site. Besides that, the project achievements, quantity, and quality of realized activities are really on a high level and I expect project termination with all our expectations fulfilled.

Skopje 02.09.2019

Marjan Gusev